

MUS 557 Topics in Theory

The Implications of Postmodern Thought for Music Theory and Analysis

Spring 1999, Thursdays 2-5 p.m.

Professor Judy Lochhead

Office: Staller 3330

Office phone: 632-7338

Department phone: 632-7330

(leave message)

Office Hours: Tuesdays, 1-3 p.m. (With occasional alterations),

and by appt.

Judith.Lochhead@SUNYSB.EDU

Americans With Disabilities Act: *If you have a physical, psychiatric, medical or learning disability that may affect your ability to carry out assigned course work, I urge you to contact the staff in the Disabled Student Services office (DSS), room 133 Humanities, 632-6748/TDD. DSS will review your concerns and determine, with you, what accommodations are necessary and appropriate.*

Focus

The seminar will consider selected instances of music theoretical and analytical practices in light of postmodern thought broadly conceived to include poststructuralist philosophy, philosophies of embodiment, postmodern theory, feminist theory, and historical epistemology. Selected readings in postmodern thought provide a basis for critique of contemporary approaches to music theory and analysis in such areas as: linear analysis (tonal and post-tonal), set theory, timbral analysis, and others as appropriate to the interests of seminar participants. Critique of these contemporary approaches will consider such topics as: what constitutes the musical object, how it is conceived, what kinds of evidence figure in the theoretical and analytical project, how is the musical object represented. The seminar concludes 1) by considering alternatives to existing theoretical and analytical practices in light of postmodern thought and 2) how instances of recent music within the Western, concert tradition might require such alternatives. Seminar participants will produce an extended paper that develops a theoretical/analytical approach for a recent work of their choosing. All participants will present their papers to the seminar at the end of the semester.

Requirements

Attendance and participation in seminar discussion. Un-excused absences will affect the final grade for the course.

Weekly reading and class presentation. Each week some seminar participants will lead discussion on one or more of the assigned readings. All participants are required to complete all assigned reading.

Weekly position papers on one of the assigned readings.

Seminar Paper and Presentation. This will be the major project of the course which will include development of a theoretical/analytical approach to a chosen recent work.

Outline of the Investigation

I. The Larger Context

Postmodern Thought Across the Disciplines

Postmodernity:

- i) as an aesthetic principle
- ii) as a historical period
- iii) in relation to and/or as a reaction to modernity/modernism

Poststructuralism

- i) the "end" of philosophy and historicization
- ii) the interpretive turn
- iii) embodiment and epistemology
- iv) the experiential turn

Critique of Theoretical/Analytical Practices: Old and New "Attacks"

Phenomenology

Criticism

Cultural Context

Feminist Theory, Queer Theory

Hermeneutics

The Response from "Theory"

II. Defining Itself: The Post-War Growth of Music Theory and Analysis

The practice of theory and analysis

Goals: Why?

Methods: What and How?

Underlying Assumptions: Philosophical Bases

Modes of Representation

Composition, Performance, Listening

III. Tracing the Fundamentals: Music Theory and Analysis in Light of Postmodern Thought

The Musical Object

Where does it exist

What are its defining characteristics

Primary vs. secondary features?, or structure vs. quality

Evidence

What counts as evidence about a musical object ?

Are there facts about music?

Can evidence be "objective" ?

What role does experience play in the gathering of musical evidence?

Epistemology and the experiencing subject: what can we know?

Explanation and Understanding

Is there a difference between musical explanation and musical understanding?

Does analysis offer explanation or understanding?

How does a concept of musical meaning relate to understanding and/or explanation?

Can an analytic explanation be true?

Representing the Musical Object

How does musical notation or other visualist models represent the aural phenomena of music?

How do verbal concepts represent music?

What assumptions about the musical object underlie traditional musical notation?

What assumptions about the musical object underlie an analytic representation?

IV. Postmodern Phenomena in Musical Practices: Composition, Performance, Listening, and Writing about Music

Is there a postmodern music? A postmodern performance practice? A postmodern listening?

Is "New" Musicology" a "postmodern" musicology?

Is there a postmodern theory or analysis?

Bibliography

Philosophy, Critical Theory, Anthropology

Roland Barthes. 1988[1977] *Image-Music-Text*, trans. Stephen Heath (New York:Noonday Press) PN37.B29

_____, 1986. *The Rustle of Language* (New York:Hill and Wang).

Kenneth Baynes, James Bohman, and Thomas McCarthy, eds.. 1996 [1987]. *After Philosophy:End or Transformation?* (Cambridge, MA:The MIT Press). [this book on order]

Seyla Benhabib. 1992. *Situating the Self:Gender, Community and Postmodernism in Contemporary Ethics* (New York:Routledge). BJ1012.B45

Nick Crossley. 1994. *The Politics of Subjectivity:Between Foucault and Merleau-Ponty* (Aldershot:Avebury).

Thomas Csordas. 1994. *The Sacred Self:A Cultural Phenomenology of Charismatic Healing* (Berkeley and Los Angeles:University of California Press). BT732.5.C86

_____.ed. 1994. *Embodiment and Experience* (NY:Cambridge University Press).

Lorraine Daston and Peter Galison. 1992. "The Image of Objectivity," *Representations* 40: 81-128.

Hubert Dreyfus and Peter Rabinow. 1983. *Michel Foucault:Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, 2nd Edition (Chicago:University of Chicago Press).B2430.F724 D73 1983.

Hal Foster, ed. 1983. *The Anti-Aesthetic: Essays on Postmodern Culture* (Seattle:Bay Press). BH301.M54 A57 1983.

Michel Foucault. 1992 [1986]. *Foucault:A Critical Reader*, David Hoy, ed. (Cambridge, CA:Basil Blackwell).

_____. 1994 [1971] *The Order of Things:An Archaeology of the Human Sciences* (New York:Vintage Books).

_____. 1972. *The Archaeology of Knowledge and The Discourse on Language* (New York:Pantheon Press).

_____. 1984. *The Foucault Reader*, Paul Rabinow, ed. (New York:Pantheon Books).

Michael Jackson. 1996. *Things as They Are: New Directions in Phenomenological Anthropology* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press). GN33.T55 1996

Frederic Jameson. 1991. *Postmodernism, or The Cultural Logic of late Capitalism* (Durham: Duke University Press).

Elizabeth Grosz. 1994. *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press).

Jürgen Habermas. 1987. "Modernity--An Incomplete Project," *Interpretive Social Science: A Second Look*, eds. Paul Rabinow and William M. Sullivan (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press): 141-156. [reprinted from *The New German Critique* 22 (1981)] H61.I6 1987

Donna Haraway. 1988. "Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective," *Feminist Studies* 14/3575-99.

David Harvey. 1989. *The Condition of Postmodernity* (Oxford and Cambridge: Blackwell).

David R. Hiley, James F. Bohman, and Richard Shusterman, eds. 1991. "Introduction: The Interpretive Turn," *The Interpretive Turn: Philosophy, Science, Culture* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press): 1-14. BD241.I56 1991

Linda Hutcheon. 1989. *The Politics of Postmodernism* (London and New York: Routledge). PN3503.H84 1989

Don Ihde. 1979. *Technics and Praxis: A Philosophy of Technology* (Dordrecht: Reidel Publishers).

_____. 1990. *Technology and the Life-World: From Garden to Earth* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press).

_____. 1991. *Instrumental Realism* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press).

Hilary Lawson. 1989. "Stories About Stories," *Dismantling the Truth: Reality in the Post-Modern World*, eds. Hilary Lawson and Lisa Appignanesi. (New York: St. Martin's Press): xi-xxviii.

Jean-François Lyotard. 1993 [1984]. *The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge*, trans. Geoff Bennington and Brian Massumi (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press. [French, 1979])

David McNeill. 1992. *Hand and Mind: What Gestures Reveal About the Mind* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press). P117.M36

Maurice Merleau-Ponty. 1978 [1962]. *The Phenomenology of Perception*, trans. Colin Smith (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul). BD352.M383 1981

_____. 1968. *The Visible and the Invisible*, trans. Alphonso Lingis (Evanston:Northwestern University Press). B2430.M379 V513

William R. Paulson. 1988. *The Noise of Culture:Literary Texts in a World of Information* (Ithaca and London:Cornell University Press). PN98.I54 P38 1988

Mary Poovey. 1998. *A History of the Modern Fact:Problems of Knowledge in the Sciences of Wealth and Society* (Chicago and London:University of Chicago Press). HA29.P639

Richard Rorty. 1980. *Philosophy and the Mirror of Nature* (Oxford:Basil Blackwell).

_____. 1982. *Consequences of Pragmatism* (Brighton:Harvester Press).

Joan Scott. 1991. "The Evidence of Experience," *Critical Inquiry* 17/4:773-797.

Susan R. Suleiman and Inge Crosman. 1980. *The Reader in the Text:Essays on Audience and Interpretation* (Princeton:Princeton University Press).

Charles Taylor. 1987. "Interpretation and the Sciences of Man," *Interpretive Social Science:A Second Look*, eds. Paul Rabinow and William M. Sullivan (Berkeley and Los Angeles:University of California Press). [reprinted from *The Review of Metaphysics* 25/1 (1971)]

Stephen Toulmin. 1982. "The Construal of Reality:Criticism in Modern and Postmodern Science," *Critical Inquiry* 9/1:93-112.

Francisco Varela, Evan Thompson, and Eleanor Rosch. 1991. *The Embodied Mind:Cognitive Science and Human Experience* (Cambridge:Cambridge University Press).

Denis Wood. 1992. *The Power of Maps*, with John Fels (New York:The Guilford Press).

Steve Woolgar. 1989. "The Ideology of Representation and the Role of the Agent," *Dismantling the Truth:Reality in the Post-Modern World*, eds. Hilary Lawson and Lisa Appignanesi. (New York:St. Martin's Press):131-144.

Iris Young. 1990. *Throwing Like a Girl and Other Essays in Feminist Philosophy and Social Theory* (Bloomington:Indiana University Press).

Music

Theodor Adorno. 1982 [19??]. "On the Problem of Music Analysis," *Music Analysis* I/2:169-72.

Kofi Agawu. 1989. "Stravinsky's *Mass* and Stravinsky Analysis," *Music Theory Spectrum* 11/2:139-163.

_____. 1993. "Does Music Theory Need Musicology?" *Current Musicology* 53:89-98.

_____. 1997. "Analyzing Music under the New Musicological Regime," *Current Musicology* 15/3:297-307.

Milton Babbitt. 1975 [1972]. "The Structure and Function of Musical Theory," *Perspectives on Contemporary Music Theory*, eds. Benjamin Boretz and Edward T. Cone (New York:Norton).

_____. 1972. "Contemporary Music Composition and Music Theory as Contemporary Intellectual History," *Perspectives in Musicology* (New York:Norton):151-84. ML55.B77 1975

David Beach. 1979. "Pitch Structure and the Analytic Process in Atonal Music:An Interpretation of the Theory of Sets," *Music Theory Spectrum* 1:7-22.

William Benjamin. 1979. "Ideas of Order in Motivic Music," *Journal of Music Theory*

John Beverly. 1989. "The Ideology of Postmodern Music and Left Ppolitics," *Critical Quarterly* 31:40-56.

Stephen Blum. 1993. "In Defense of Close Reading and Close Listening," *Current Musicology* 53:41-54.

Candace Brower. 1993. "Memory and the Perception of Rhythm," *Music Theory Spectrum* 15/1:19-35.

Mathew Brown and Douglas Dempster. 1989. "The Scientific Image of Music Theory," *Journal of Music Theory* 33/1:65-106.

Also see the other articles in this volume under "Theory Colloquium"-articles by Benjamin Boretz, Nicholas Cook, John Rahn, Richard Taruskin, and Pieter C. van den Toorn..

Scott Burnham and Lawrence Kramer. 1992. "The Criticism of Analysis and the Analysis of Criticism; Criticizing Criticis, Analyzing Analysis, " *Nineteenth-Century Music* 16/1:70-79. Also see Leo Treitler's communication to the editor regarding Burnham's and Kramer's exchange: *Nineteenth-Century Music* 17/1:103-104.

Patricia Carpenter. 1967. "The Musical Object," *Current Musicology* V:56-87. [see also response to this article in the same volume]

Edward Cone. 1989. *Music, A View from Delft:Selected Essays*, ed. Robert P. Morgan (Chicago:University of Chicago Press).

Nicholas Cook. 1996. "Review-Essay: Putting the Meaning back into Music, or Semiotics Revisited," *Music Theory Spectrum* 18/1:106-123.

_____. 1999. "Analysing Performance, and Performing Analysis," *Rethinking Music*, Cook and Mark Everist, eds. (Oxford: Clarendon Press) [this book is due out Feb. 99]

_____. 1995. "Music Theory and the Postmodern Muse: An Afterword," *Concert Music, Rock, and Jazz Since 1945*, Elizabeth West Marvin and Richard Hermann, eds. (Rochester: University of Rochester Press):422-39.

James A. Davis. 1993. *Positivist Philosophy and the Foundations of Atonal Music Theory* (Ph.D. Dissertation, Boston University).

Robert Fink. 1998. "Elvis Everywhere," *American Music* 16/2:135-179.

Alfred Fisher. 1992. "Unmasking Rigor: Composition, Analysis, and the Poetry of Experience," *Perspectives of New Music* 30/2:6-21.

Marion Guck. 1994. "Analytical Fictions," *Music Theory Spectrum* 16/2:217-230.

Ethan Haimo. 1996. "Atonality, Analysis, and the Intentional Fallacy," *Music Theory Spectrum* 18/2:167-199.

Marcia Herndon. 1974. "Analysis: The Herding of Sacred Cows," *Ethnomusicology* 18/2:219-62.

Joseph Kerman. 1980. "How We Got Into Analysis, and How to Get Out," *Critical Inquiry* 7/2:311-331.

_____. 1994. "Close Readings of the Heard Kind," *Nineteenth-Century Music* 17/3:209-19.

Jonathan Kramer. 1995. "Beyond Unity: Toward an Understanding of Musical Postmodernism," *Concert Music, Rock, and Jazz since 1945*, Elizabeth West Marvin and Richard Hermann, eds. (Rochester: University of Rochester Press).

Lawrence Kramer. 1993. "Music Criticism and the Postmodernist Turn: In Contrary Motion with Gary Tomlinson," *Current Musicology* 53:25-35.

Fred Lerdahl. 1992. "Cognitive Constraints on Compositional Systems," *Contemporary Music Review*:97-122.

Janet Levy. 1987. "Covert and Casual Values in Recent Writings About Music," *Journal of Musicology* V/1:3-27.

George Lipsitz. 1994. *Dangerous Crossroads: Popular Music, Postmodernism and the Poetics of Place* (London and New York: Verso).

Richard Littlefield and David Neumeier. 1992. "Rewriting Schenker:Narrative-History-Ideology," *Music Theory Spectrum* 14/1:38-65.

Judy Lochhead. 1998. "Retooling the Technique," *Music Theory Online* 4/2.
(<http://boethius.music.ucsb.edu/mto/>)

Fred Maus. 1997. "Music and Drama," *Music and Meaning*, Jenefer Robinson, ed. (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press):105-130. [reprinted from *Music Theory Spectrum* 10]

Susan McClary. ????. "Terminal Prestige:The Case of Avant-Garde Music Composition," *Critical Critique* 12:57-81. [reprinted in *Keeping Score*]

_____. 1994. "Paradigm Dissonances, Music Theory, Cultural Studies, and Feminist Criticism," *Perspectives of New Music* 32/1:???

Patrick McCreless. 1997. "Contemporary Music Theory and the New Musicology," *Journal of Musicology* 15/3:291-96.

Leonard Meyer. 1973. *Explaining Music* (Chicago and London:University of Chicago Press).

Simon Miller, ed. 1993. *The Last Post:Music After Modernism* (Manchester:Manchester Listen University Press).

Robert Morgan. "On the Analysis of Recent Music,' *Critical Inquiry* 33-53.

George Perle. 1995[1990]. "Pitch-Class Set Analysis: An Evaluation," *The Right Notes:23 Selected Essays by George Perle on 20th Century Music* (Stuyvesant, NY:Pendragon Press):275-95. [reprinted from *The Journal of Musicology* 8/2]

Peter Rabinowitz. 1985. "Circumstantial Evidence:Musical Analysis and Theories of Reading," *Mosaic* 18/4:159-73.

Jenefer Robinson, ed. 1997. *Music and Meaning* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press).

Robert Snarrenberg. 1986. "Hearings of Webern's 'Bewegt'," *Perspectives of New Music* 24/2:386-??.

Alan Street. 1989. "Superior Myths, Dogmatic Allegories:The Resistance to Musical Unity," *Music Analysis* 8/1-2:77-124.

John Rahn. 1979. "Aspects of Musical Explanation," *Perspectives of New Music* 1:204-224.

David Schwartz. 1993. "Listening Subjects:Semiotics, Psychoanalysis, and the Music of John Adams and Steve Reich," *Perspectives of New Music* 31/2:???

_____. 1992. "Postmodernism, The Subject and the Real in John Adams's *Nixon in China*," *Indiana Theory Review*:107-136.

Rose Rosengard Subotnick.1996. "Toward a Deconstruction of Structural Listening:A Critique of Schoenberg, Adorno, and Stravinsky," *Deconstructive Variations:Music and Reason in Western Society* (Minneapolis and London:University of Minneapolis Press):148-76.

Richard Taruskin. 1979. "Review of *The Harmonic Organization of the Rite of Spring*, by Allen Forte," *Current Musicology* xxviii:114-29.

_____. 1986. Letter to the Editor. *Music Analysis* V/2-3:313-20.

_____. 1987. "Reply to van den Toorn," *In Theory Only* 10/3:47-57.

Gary Tomlinson. 1982. "The Web of Culture:A Context for Musicology," *Nineteenth Century Music* 7:350-62.

_____ 1993a. *Music in Renaissance Magic:Toward a Historiography of Others* (Chicago and London:University of Chicago Press).

_____. 1993b. "Musical Pasts and Postmodern Musicologies:A Response to Lawrence Kramer," and "Tomlinson Responds," *Current Musicology* 53:18-24 and 36-35.

Leo Treitler. 1989 [1982]. "'To Worship that Celestial Sound':Motives for Analysis," *The Journal of Musicology* 1/2:153-70. [reprinted in Treitler, *Music and The Historical Imagination*]

Pieter van den Toorn. 1987. "Taruskin's Angle," *In Theory Only* 10/3:27-46.